

Message

From: FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=180070]
Sent: 9/21/2009 5:12:07 PM
To: COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000] [REDACTED]@Monsanto.com]
Subject: RE: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

I didn't find anything on the Australian site either ...however take this question 5. It is not Roundup that is taken up it is glyphosate. It stops the synthesis of 3 amino acids (they are used to make proteins) and this "process" is also found in microbes and fungi.

5. How does Roundup work?

Roundup is taken up through the leaves and moves in the sap flow throughout the plant. It stops the production of proteins so that the plant starves. This process is found only in plants; Roundup has extremely low toxicity to humans and wildlife.

Or this - you cannot say that Roundup does not cause cancer..we have not done carcinogenicity studies with "Roundup".

2. Will Roundup harm my family or me?

Based on the results of short term and long term testing, it can be concluded that Roundup poses no danger to human health when used according to label directions. In long term exposure studies of animals, Roundup did not cause cancer, birth defects or adverse reproductive changes at dose levels far in excess of likely exposure.

I will follow up with the Monsanto folks who interface with Scotts...they are aware that Scotts does these things.

Donna

-----Original Message-----

From: COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000]
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2009 11:07 AM
To: FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]
Subject: RE: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

I did not find any reference on their main (US) page to "biodegradable."

-----Original Message-----

From: FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2009 11:06 AM
To: COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000]
Subject: RE: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

Did you find the link?

This is to their Q&A and I can tell you they have a number of things that a not acceptable.
<http://www.scottsaustralia.com.au/FAQs/Roundup>

-----Original Message-----

From: COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000]
Sent: Monday, September 21, 2009 8:11 AM
To: PERSON, JANICE L [AG/1030]; FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; HELSCHER, THOMAS M [AG/1000]
Subject: Fw: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

Janice and Donna,

Here's the Australian thread, to the latest message.

John

----- Original Message -----

From: LEADER, MICHAEL [AG/5020]
To: ANDERSON, NEIL J [AG/5020]; MCNAUGHTON, HONI JANINE [AG/5020]; MCGREGOR, JOHN [AG/5020]; HELSCHER, THOMAS M [AG/1000]

Cc: MCLEAN, KERYN [AG/5020]; TAYLOR, IAN N [AG/5020]; ARMSTRONG, JANICE M [AG/5340]; COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000]

Sent: Mon Sep 21 00:08:56 2009

Subject: RE: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

Thanks Neil. Honi has already have pointed out the flaws in the studies, but there can't be any harm in doing so again. Studies on the safety of Roundup is a good approach, but I believe there are also some on glyphosate's benefits for the environment (even if the surfactant is not biodegradable). It's a shame the Scott's guy is blaming us too!!

Cheers

Michael

Michael Leader

Corporate and Regulatory Affairs Lead, Australia/New Zealand

Level 12, 600 St Kilda Road; Melbourne VIC 3004

Email: [REDACTED]@monsanto.com

Ph: +61 [REDACTED] | Mob: +61 4 [REDACTED] | Fax: +61 [REDACTED]

<<http://www.monsanto.com.au/>>

From: ANDERSON, NEIL J [AG/5020]

Sent: Monday, September 21, 2009 12:39 PM

To: MCNAUGHTON, HONI JANINE [AG/5020]; MCGREGOR, JOHN [AG/5020]; HELSCHER, THOMAS M [AG/1000]

Cc: LEADER, MICHAEL [AG/5020]; MCLEAN, KERYN [AG/5020]; TAYLOR, IAN N [AG/5020]; ARMSTRONG, JANICE M [AG/5340]; COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000]

Subject: RE: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

Hi Honi

The reporter has printed the correct information that "Glyphosate is biodegradable but the surfactant is not". However, then she goes into a sensationalism mode quoting "studies" that suggest Roundup is not safe, which is probably derived from her interview of the Fremantle activist. I feel the response to FH needs to reiterate that her statement on biodegradability is correct, reiterate that Roundup is safe (and provide references), and if there are flaws in any of the studies quoted, point out these flaws.

Neil Anderson

QA & Formulations Lead, Asia Pacific

Monsanto Australia Ltd

Mobile phone: International [REDACTED]; Australia [REDACTED]

From: MCNAUGHTON, HONI JANINE [AG/5020]

Sent: Monday, September 21, 2009 10:56 AM

To: MCGREGOR, JOHN [AG/5020]; ANDERSON, NEIL J [AG/5020]; HELSCHER, THOMAS M [AG/1000]

Cc: LEADER, MICHAEL [AG/5020]; MCLEAN, KERYN [AG/5020]; TAYLOR, IAN N [AG/5020]; ARMSTRONG, JANICE M [AG/5340]; COMBEST, JOHN C [AG/1000]

Subject: Roundup article in Fremantle Herald

Importance: High

Hi John and Neil

MONGLY01192116

The article in question has appeared in the Fremantle Herald as expected.

We need to think about our response. Possible suggestions:

- Letter from Scott's to the FH reiterating the correct information
- Letter from Monsanto to FH reiterating the safety of Roundup, etc

We may also need to compose a letter to all of Scott's Roundup customers (in WA) dismissing the allegations in the article. FH has a circulation of 20,000. However, the FTO concern is here in WA during this critical time.

· Keryn: You may want to contact DAFWA and other stakeholders as well as growers to explain what we plan to do.

· Ian: GSWG letter reiterating the safety of glyphosate from Steve Powles

Any actions and responses will need to be cleared with the US.

We will need to have a phone call about this including Scotts.

Please let me know your thoughts. I think you'll agree we need to jump on this.

Honi

Honi McNaughton
Public Affairs Manager

Monsanto Australia
PO Box 6051
St Kilda Central
Vic 3008
Office: (03) [REDACTED]
Fax: (03) [REDACTED]
Mobile: [REDACTED]
<<http://www.monsanto.com.au/>>

Monsanto Twitter: <http://www.twitter.com/monsantoco> <<http://www.twitter.com/monsantoco>>

Monsanto's Blog: Monsanto According to Monsanto <<http://www.monsantoblog.com/>>

Monsanto For the Record: http://www.monsanto.com/monsanto_today/for_the_record/default.asp
<http://www.monsanto.com/monsanto_today/for_the_record/default.asp>

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

TRIAL EXHIBIT 245

Case No. 3:16-cv-0525-VC

Date Entered _____

By _____
Deputy Clerk